

This document was created using best practices in document accessibility. Should you need assistance reading or understanding this document, call 902-543-8181 or email [info@modl.ca](mailto:info@modl.ca).

## **Planning Advisory Committee Meeting Agenda**

**Thursday, September 26, 2024 – 7:00 p.m.**

**MODL Council Chambers, 10 Allee Champlain Drive, Cookville NS**

**In Person and Via Audio and Video Conference**

- 1. Call To Order**
    - 1.1 Mi'kma'ki Territorial Acknowledgement
  - 2. Review of Procedure for Public to Address the Committee – Chairperson (below)**
  - 3. Approval of Agenda** (any other items to be added)
  - 4. Approval of Minutes of Thursday, February 22, 2024**
  - 5. Business Arising from Minutes**
  - 6. Planning Advisory Committee Matters**
    - 6.1. Nil
  - 7. Heritage Advisory Committee Matters**
    - 7.1. Application to Alter a Municipal Heritage Property –  
Christ Church, 455 Northfield Road, Maitland ..... 1-8
  - 8. Added Items**
  - 9. In Camera**
    - 9.1. Nil
  - 10. Next Meeting Date:** TBA
  - 11. Adjournment**
- 

### **Procedure for Addressing the Committee**

An opportunity will be provided to all citizens to address the Committee on each agenda item shown on this Agenda or added to the Agenda by the Committee. Individuals who wish to address the Committee are asked to note the following:

- On each matter on the Committee's Agenda, the Chair will seek public comment upon the completion of staff's presentation.
- Each person shall state their name.
- All statements and questions shall be directed to the Chairperson.
- Presentations shall be limited to 10 minutes. Persons wishing to address the Committee a second time will be given opportunity to do so once all others in attendance have had the opportunity to address the Committee. Persons addressing the Committee for a second time shall limit their presentations to 5 minutes.

Anyone wishing to address the Committee on a matter not included on this Agenda can have the matter added to the next meeting's Agenda by contacting Jeff Merrill, Director of Planning, at 902-541-1340 or by email at [planning@modl.ca](mailto:planning@modl.ca)



## Municipality of the District of Lunenburg

### Request for Decision

**Report To: Heritage Advisory Committee**

**Submitted By: Anna Giblin, Heritage Planner**

**Date: September 18, 2024**

**Re: Application to Alter a Municipal Heritage Property – Christ Church at 455**

**Northfield Road, Maitland, NS**

---

### **Origin**

Planning staff received a request for an exterior alteration to Christ Church in Maitland, a registered heritage property. The proposed exterior alteration is to replace one side of the roof of the church with a different colour of asphalt shingles.

### **Recommendation**

Staff recommends the Heritage Advisory Committee consider making a positive recommendation to Council, permitting the proposed alteration as requested by the applicant.

#### **Motion:**

**That the Heritage Advisory Committee recommends to Council to approve the proposed alteration to the municipal heritage property of Christ Church, located at 455 Northfield Road, Maitland, by permitting the change in colour of asphalt roof shingles on the structure.**

### **Background**

Following By-law 043 subsection 10 (1), planning staff received a letter on September 5, 2024, requesting an exterior alteration to Christ Church, a registered municipal heritage property, located at 455 Northfield Road in Maitland. The request, attached in Appendix A, is to replace

the asphalt roof shingles on the church with a different colour. The building currently has a green coloured asphalt-shingled roof that has faded overtime. The proposed colour of new asphalt shingles is grey/black. Although not stated in the letter of request, only half of the roof is to be replaced with the grey/black coloured asphalt shingles at this time.

Justification for alteration is that (1) the roof requires replacement, and (2) the existing roof shingle colour cannot be sourced.

Pursuant to Heritage Property Policy 027, subclause 5.1 (c), changing the colour scheme of the structure, is considered a **substantial alteration**. Therefore, this proposed alteration requires the review and approval of the Heritage Advisory Committee and Council.

On September 18, staff completed a site visit to photograph the church and noticed that the roof replacement work was already underway. The southeast facing side of the roof is in greater need of replacement, so this is the side that is being replaced. The reason for only a portion of the roof being replaced is due to lack of funding.

The question for the Advisory Committee is whether the proposed alteration adversely affects the heritage aspect of the buildings' exterior architecture, by replacing one side of the church's roof with grey/black shingles.

## **Discussion**

### Property and Heritage-Associated Details

Christ Church Anglican Church is situated on top of a high knoll on Northfield Road in Maitland and is one of the oldest churches in the Maitland area built in 1866. It is valued for not only its age, but also for its exterior board and batten construction style, ornate steeple, and a design that combines Gothic Revival with Greek Revival architectural details. Christ Church (PID # 60678208) was registered on January 23, 2001, as a Municipal Heritage Property. The reasons provided for heritage designation at that time were associated with the following:

**Age:** Constructed in 1866

**Local Historical Significance:** In the early years, the parish served a very broad region as far as New Germany and Northfield.

**Architecture and Construction:** Greek Revival design and Greek Revival ornamentation. The church remains on its original foundation comprised of slabs of split granite. There have been several minor alterations which include electrical hook-up, the belfry and steeple additions, an entrance addition, as well as a choir room addition. These additions occurred prior to it being registered as a Municipal Heritage Property.

Character-defining elements that relate to its Gothic Revival architecture include:

- board and batten cladding (rare for churches in the area)
- wooden rake board and rake moulding with scribe strips
- asymmetrical floor plan
- cross-gabled roof
- lancet arch windows on faces with board and batten construction
- tower with wooden shingle construction
- steeple with wooden shingle construction with a band of ornamented shingles half way up the spire
- steeple with octagonal construction with four small gabled roofs in opposing pairs where steeple meets the tower and four small hip roofs in opposing pairs where steeple meets the tower
- post and beam construction
- finial Gothic cross at peak of steeple

Character-defining elements that relate to its Greek Revival architecture include:

- return eaves
- columns supporting a projecting cross-gabled entrance
- cornerboards designed as simple Greek Revival pilasters

Although the list of character-defining elements mentions roof features, such as the cross-gable roof, the tower covered with wooden shingles, and the steeple featuring wooden shingles with a band of decorative shingles, the colour of asphalt roof material has not been identified as a character-defining element.

At present, the roof has green asphalt shingles that match some of the other character-defining roof elements. However, as the colour of asphalt roof material is not a character-defining element, the primary concern should be replacing the roof to preserve the overall structure. Given that the age of the structure pre-dates the invention of asphalt shingles, the use of asphalt shingles is not original to the structure.

In the past, the steeple of Christ Church has undergone exterior repairs. However, as the steeple is a character-defining element, in that case, Council required that similar materials and colours be used to maintain the steeple's original architectural design.

While the church's cross-gabled roof is considered a character-defining element, changing the colour of the roofing material will not alter the roof shape or other roof elements. Staff's

opinion is that changing the shingle colour from green to grey/black will have minimal impact on the overall character defining-elements of the property.

### Standards and Guidelines

The Heritage Advisory Committee has adopted the Standards and Guidelines for the Conservation of Historic Places in Canada and uses this document as a key guide for reviewing substantial alterations to municipally registered heritage properties. The guideline helps determine whether a project falls under Preservation, Rehabilitation, or Restoration.

Since the alteration involves replacing a deteriorated roof, the proposed work falls under rehabilitation treatment. The guideline states, rehabilitation involves the sensitive adaptation of a historic place or of an individual component for a continuing or compatible contemporary use, while protecting its heritage value. This is achieved through repairs, alterations and/or additions.

Consider Rehabilitation as the primary treatment when:

**(a) Repair or replacement of deteriorated features is necessary**

(b) Alterations or additions to the historic place are planned for a new or continued use; and,

(c) Depiction during a particular period in its history is not appropriate.

All projects must consider Standards 1 to 9. Rehabilitation projects must additionally consider standards 10 to 13 (Standards attached in Appendix B). These standards can help guide the committee in their decision. Notably, this proposal aligns with the following Standards:

**Standard 7:** Evaluate the existing condition of character-defining elements to determine the appropriate intervention needed. Use the gentlest means possible for any intervention. Respect heritage value when undertaking an intervention.

**Standard 8:** Maintain character-defining elements on an ongoing basis. Repair character-defining elements by reinforcing their materials using recognized conservation methods. Replace in kind any extensively deteriorated or missing parts of character-defining elements, where there are surviving prototypes.

**Standard 11:** Conserve the heritage value and character-defining elements when creating any new additions to an historic place or any related new construction. Make the new work physically and visually compatible with, subordinate to and distinguishable from the historic place.

## Conclusion

Staff recommends that the Heritage Advisory Committee consider making a positive recommendation to Council, permitting the proposed alteration of changing the colour of the roof to replacing half of grey/black asphalt shingles.

Although changing the colour scheme of a structure is considered a substantial alteration, in this case, the colour of the roofing material is not considered a character-defining element. The church's cross-gabled roof, which is a character-defining element, will remain structurally unchanged by this alteration. If anything, this work will help preserve the structure along with its many other character-defining features.

While it would be most ideal to maintain the existing colour of asphalt shingle since it matches the existing colour scheme of the building, it is important that the roof be replaced with shingles that can be adequately sourced. Given that the existing roof is made with asphalt shingles, using the same material in a different colour is a practical option.



*Image 1 Christ Church front view*



*Image 2 Christ Church side view (northwest)*

Report Preparation	
Department	Planning and Development Services
Report Prepared by	Anna Giblin, Heritage Planner
Report Approved by	Jeff Merrill, Director
Date Reviewed by C.A.O.	

Appendix A

CHRIST CHURCH

BLOCHOUSE, NS B0J 1E0

Jeff Merrill, Municipality of the District of Lunenburg  
10 Allée Champlain Drive  
Cookville, Nova Scotia B4V 9E4

RE – Shingles for roof of Christ Church

This is to advise as per conversation with Stuart Dauphinee -Warden from Christ Church that we need to replace the roof shingles on the church and are not able to obtain the replacement shingles in the color green the is currently on the roof and will need to use a different color of shingles.

If you have any questions please contact Stuart at [REDACTED]

Regards

*Sharon Wade,*

Board of Management Christ Church



## THE STANDARDS

The Standards are not presented in a hierarchical order. All standards for any given type of treatment must be considered, and applied where appropriate, to any conservation project.

### General Standards for Preservation, Rehabilitation and Restoration

1. Conserve the *heritage value* of an *historic place*. Do not remove, replace or substantially alter its intact or repairable *character-defining elements*. Do not move a part of an historic place if its current location is a character-defining element.
2. Conserve changes to an *historic place* that, over time, have become *character-defining elements* in their own right.
3. Conserve *heritage value* by adopting an approach calling for *minimal intervention*.
4. Recognize each *historic place* as a physical record of its time, place and use. Do not create a false sense of historical development by adding elements from other historic places or other properties, or by combining features of the same property that never coexisted.
5. Find a use for an *historic place* that requires minimal or no change to its *character-defining elements*.
6. Protect and, if necessary, stabilize an *historic place* until any subsequent *intervention* is undertaken. Protect and preserve archaeological resources in place. Where there is potential for disturbing archaeological resources, take mitigation measures to limit damage and loss of information.
7. Evaluate the existing condition of *character-defining elements* to determine the appropriate *intervention* needed. Use the gentlest means possible for any intervention. Respect *heritage value* when undertaking an intervention.
8. Maintain *character-defining elements* on an ongoing basis. Repair character-defining elements by reinforcing their materials using recognized conservation methods. Replace in kind any extensively deteriorated or missing parts of character-defining elements, where there are surviving *prototypes*.
9. Make any *intervention* needed to preserve *character-defining elements* physically and visually compatible with the *historic place* and identifiable on close inspection. Document any intervention for future reference.

### **Additional Standards Relating to Rehabilitation**

- 10.** Repair rather than replace *character-defining elements*. Where character-defining elements are too severely deteriorated to repair, and where sufficient physical evidence exists, replace them with new elements that match the forms, materials and detailing of sound versions of the same elements. Where there is insufficient physical evidence, make the form, material and detailing of the new elements compatible with the character of the *historic place*.
- 11.** Conserve the *heritage value* and *character-defining elements* when creating any new additions to an *historic place* or any related new construction. Make the new work physically and visually compatible with, subordinate to and distinguishable from the historic place.
- 12.** Create any new additions or related new construction so that the essential form and integrity of an *historic place* will not be impaired if the new work is removed in the future.

### **Additional Standards Relating to Restoration**

- 13.** Repair rather than replace *character-defining elements* from the *restoration* period. Where character-defining elements are too severely deteriorated to repair and where sufficient physical evidence exists, replace them with new elements that match the forms, materials and detailing of sound versions of the same elements.
- 14.** Replace missing features from the *restoration* period with new features whose forms, materials and detailing are based on sufficient physical, documentary and/or oral evidence.